

**Conservation
Review Board**

Ministry of Citizenship,
Culture and Recreation
4th floor
400 University Ave
Toronto ON M7A 2R9
Tel (416) 314-7137
Fax (416) 314-7175

**Commission des
biens culturels**

Ministère des Affaires civiles.
de la Culture et des Loisirs
4e étage
400 avenue University
Toronto ON M7A 2R9
Tél (416) 314-7137
Télé (416) 314-7175



**RE: TOWN OF RICHMOND HILL - INTENTION TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY
KNOWN AS THE "TRENCH CARRIAGE WORKS",
10117-10123 YONGE STREET, RICHMOND HILL.**

Gerald Kilian, Chair.
Andrew Mathers, Member

March 17, 1999

This hearing was convened under Section 29(8) of the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, ch.0.18 for the purpose of reporting to the Council of the Town of Richmond Hill whether in the opinion of this Board, on the basis of the evidence it will hear, the property known municipally as 10117-10123 Yonge Street ("Trench Carriage Works"), should be designated by by-law under the Act, an objection having been raised by the owner, who claimed that any restriction placed on the building would render it economically unviable.

Notice of this hearing was given under the Act in the Liberal on March 9, 1999 by the Board. The relevant affidavit by a member of the Board's staff is Exhibit 1.

Prior to the meeting the Board visited the building and was able to view the site and the exterior of the property.

Present: Teresa Kowalishin - Solicitor for the Town of Richmond Hill
George Duncan - Heritage Coordinator, Town of Richmond Hill
Su Murdoch - Consultant, Historical & Architectural Research
Bill Manos - owner, 10117-10119 Yonge Street
Voula Manos - owner, 10117-10119 Yonge Street

Case for the Town of Richmond Hill:

Ms. Kowalishin presented Exhibits 1 to 20; Exhibits 2, 3 and 7 verified current ownership of the subject property. The property with municipal address 10117-10119 Yonge Street is owned by Bill Manos and Voula Manos who have objected to the intention to designate the subject property. The property with municipal address 10121-10123 is owned by Peter Vassos who has not objected to the intention to designate the subject property.

Ms. Kowalishin reviewed the reasons for the proposed designation:

"Trench's Carriage Works is recommended for designation for historical and architectural reasons.

Trench's Carriage Works was the largest and best known of Richmond Hill's 19th century industries. William Trench established a blacksmithing business on this site in 1857. He later expanded his operation to specialize in the manufacture of carriages and other horse -drawn vehicles. The three storey portion of the existing complex was built in 1878. The two storey northern section was added in 1882 as the enterprise flourished.

Significant architectural features include the original brickwork with beaded pointing and 6 over 6 sash windows of the northern building; the yellow brick facing and three part windows and, two part, 6 light casement windows of the southern building; the wooden store fronts and wooden cornice of the southern building; and the single -storey rear addition with 9 light casement windows." (Exhibit 10)

In support of this, Ms. Kowalishin called upon the following witnesses:

Ms. Su Murdoch: Principal, Su Murdoch Historical Consulting. Specialist since 1990 in historical and architectural research, site evaluation and conservation. (Exhibit 8)

Ms. Murdoch was retained by the Town of Richmond Hill for several projects including the subject property. She reviewed her report (Exhibit 9) which outlined the arrival of the Trench family in York County, 1840, from Scotland. Sons and grandsons of the original Trench settlers established a successful blacksmith business which expanded during the mid -to late 1800's to become the Trench Carriage Works.

Exhibit 10, page 4, reports: "At its height of production, the company made all of the coaches that ran up Yonge Street, including the popular John Thompson stagecoach...At was a heavy omnibus drawn by four horses that could carry a load of mail, parcels and people."

Ms. Murdoch described the then public interest in the activities of the Trench Carriage Works by citing a number of references in contemporary publications, e.g. "March 16, 1883: Trench's steam works will soon be in full blast - offered to blow a whistle four times a day for village if a whistle is supplied."

Ms. Murdoch stressed the importance of the Yonge Street location for the carriage works and her report describes the arrival in 1896 of the Metropolitan Radial Railway thus ending the stagecoach business and signaling the dawn of the automobile.

Ms. Murdoch traced the history of the Trench family and its ties to the subject property until 1949 when it was sold. Thomas Trench died about 1957 and the last of his property holdings in the Town of Richmond Hill were sold in 1959.

George Duncan - Heritage Coordinator, Town of Richmond Hill and expert in heritage conservation (Exhibit 11).

Mr. Duncan emphasized that changes to historical buildings are an integral part of their history and that these changes, are a reflection of a process. In spite of some recent changes, certain aspects of the original exterior of the Trench Carriage Works building are still evident. He stated that the subject property was the last of many carriage works existing in the area.

Mr. Duncan referred to Exhibits 12, 14, 15, 16 and 17 which review the various reports and planning documents that support either directly or indirectly the need to preserve or enhance the historical and/or architectural character of Richmond Hill.

"The Trench Carriage Works is a rare survivor from the days of local industry, before railways and large scale manufacturing in major urban centres made them obsolete. This is the last of its kind in Richmond Hill. There are no carriage maker factories remaining in our neighbouring municipalities of Markham and Vaughan, though they once existed there."
(Exhibit 12)

Case for the Objector:

Bill Manos - owner of 10117 -10119 Yonge Street

Mr. Manos purchased the property in 1977* and maintains it as a rental income venture. He feels that if the property is designated under the present "Intention to Designate" he will be unreasonably constrained from making alterations in response to market conditions and therefore may not be. Able to increase the rental income.

Mr. Manos said in his letter of objection (Exhibit 23) that "Many of the buildings in the area have already undergone different types of renovations in the past and I would like to retain the option to do so in the future."; and that "We have been vary (sic) positive and productive members of the Richmond Hill community and wish to retain all rights reserved to any landlord or building owners."

Summary:

Ms. Kowalishin stated that the Town of Richmond Hill seeks a designation based upon historical and/or architectural significance. She tabled Exhibits 18 to 22, being reports of other hearings of the Conservation Review Board, which support the Town's position in this instance.

Mr. Manos did not choose to make a summary.

FINDINGS:

Based on the evidence presented by the witnesses for the Town of Richmond Hill, the Board finds the Trench Carriage Works, 10117-10123 Yonge Street, Richmond Hill, to be of sufficient architectural and historical interest and value to merit designation.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. That the Trench Carriage Works, 10117-10123 Yonge Street, Richmond Hill, be designated by by-law under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act;
2. That the owner(s) seek the cooperation and guidance of Mr. George Duncan and the LACAC in any alterations to the exterior of the building in order to achieve two objectives:
 - a) an economically viable use of the building;
 - b) and enhancement of the specified architectural features of preservation the exterior.

(Signed)
Gerald Killan Chair

Andrew Mathers, Member

List of Exhibits

- 1 Declaration - Nancy Smith.
- 2 R.J. Douglas, Clerk, Town of Richmond Hill certifies true and correct copy of assessment.
- 3 R.J. Douglas, certifies true and correct copy of page 702 from Assessment Rolls of Town of Richmond Hill for taxation year 1999.
- 4 R.J. Douglas, certifies true and correct copy of staff report SRP.98.206 recommended at Planning & Development Committee meeting of the Corporation of the Town of Richmond Hill held on 21st day of October 1998.
- 5 R.J. Douglas, certifies true and correct copy of an extract from the Minutes of the meeting of the Council of the Corporation of the Town of Richmond Hill held on the 2nd day of November 1998.
- 6 R.J. Douglas, certifies true and correct copy of staff report SRCSD99.02 which was received at the Council meeting of the Corporation of the Town of Richmond Hill on the 11th day of January 1999.
- 7 R.J. Douglas, certifies actions concerning parties who were notified of Notice of Intention to Designate.
- 8 Curriculum Vitae, Su Murdoch.
- 9 History of Trench Family in Ontario Since 1837, Su Murdoch.
- 10 Report, "Trench's Carriage Works, 10117 -10123 Yonge Street," prepared for the Town of Richmond Hill LACAC by Su Murdoch Archival and Historical Consulting, Barrie, 1998.
- 11 Curriculum Vitae, George Duncan.
- 12 Outline of evidence, George W. J. Duncan.
- 13 Long form for registration on title, "Reasons for Designation", 10117 -10123 Yonge Street, 1877 and 1883.
- 14 Town of Richmond Hill -"Future Directions," a Strategic Plan for the Town of Richmond Hill.
- 15 Report of the Ontario Association of Architects, **C.A.U.S.E.** team, dated May 3, 1998 for the Town of Richmond Hill.

16. R.J. Douglas certifies true and correct copy of staff report SRP.98.147.
17. Copy of Bill Pr23, An Act respecting the Corporation of the Town of Richmond Hill.
18. Copy of Conservation Review Board report dated June 30, 1977 re: Town of Amherstburg, 252 Dalhousie Street.
19. Copy of CR13 report dated October 20, 1977 re: City of Toronto, 45 Parliament Street.
20. Copy of CR13 report dated July 6, 1978 re: Village of Neustadt, the Creamery on Jacob Street West.
21. Copy of CR13 report of hearing held July 8, 1993 re: Reapplication to Revoke the Designation of 264 Woolwich Street, Guelph.
22. Copy of CRB report dated January 11, 1994, re: Town of Dundas, Collins Hotel, 33 King Street West.
23. Letter dated December 20, 1998 from Bill Manos (landlord) and Voula Manos (landlord) registering an objection to Intention to Designate.