Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Recreation

400 University Avenue Toronto ON M7A 2R9

Conservation Review Board Tel 416-314-7137 Fax 416-314-7175 Ministère du Tourisme, de la Culture et des Loisirs

400, avenue University Toronto ON M7A 2R9

Commission des Biens culturels TJI 416-314-7137 TJIJc 416-314-7175



RE: TOWN OF OAKVILLE - INTENTION TO DESIGNATE 234 LAKESHORE ROAD EAST, OAKVILLE, ONTARIO

Robert G. Bowes, Chairman Nathalie Boutet, Member Conservation Review Board August 18, 1994

The hearing was convened at the Town Hall of the Town of Oakville on August 18, 1994, pursuant to section 29(8) of the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Ch. 0.18, for the purpose of reporting to the Council of the Town of Oakville whether, in the opinion of the Board, on the basis of the evidence heard, the property known municipally as 234 Lakeshore Road East, Oakville, should be designated by by-law under the Act. One objection had been received from a citizen of Oakville, Kenneth Argue, who stated in a letter that the people who had "lived there were not important" and that the property "had undergone major structural changes to appearance" (Exhibit #5).

Notice of the hearing was given under the Act in the *Oakville Beaver* newspaper on February 5, 12 and 19, 1994, by the Board, the relevant affidavit by a member of the Board's staff being Exhibit #1.

This Board, in accordance with its custom, had the opportunity to view the property and the surrounding area prior to the hearing.

Beatrice Howell, Assistant Solicitor for the Town of Oakville, presented the case for the Town of Oakville. She called one expert witness, Ramona Boddington, the Heritage Planner for the Town. The owner of the property, Joseph Vet, also made a presentation to the Board. Kenneth Argue, the objector, did not attend the hearing.

The Case for the Town of Oakville

The Town of Oakville filed a Heritage Structure Report on 234 Lakeshore Road East (Exhibit #3), which presents the historical, architectural and contextual significance of the said property. The report was summarized by the witness for the Town of Oakville. The following description of the property is taken from this report.

The building was built by Captain William Wilson who settled in Oakville with his wife in the mid 1800s. Mr. Wilson, Captain of a schooner out of Oakville, built a large three-storey commercial building in 1855 at 234 Lakeshore Road East, which incorporated the foundations of a saddler's shop previously on the site. The building was originally occupied by a general merchant, John McCorkindale, until 1878 and then was used as a hardware store, with a number of different owners, until the 1960s.

The building, originally of polychromatic masonry, reflected an "Italianate" style which strongly influenced the "Commercial Vernacular" in Oakville. Italianate influences included the steeply pitched roof, the chimneys, and the two dormers with vaulted roofs, as well as the parapet corbelling.

Most of the original details have been lost, but the basic form and plan of the building, which is in the commercial core of Oakville, remains. The "Notice of Intention to Designate", tabled with the Heritage Structure Report, notes that features which remain include the steeply pitched roof, the symmetrical front elevation, two dormers and brick walls of the east and west facades. An interesting remaining feature of the building is the remnant of a turn-of-the-century advertisement painted on the upper west-facing facade.

The Heritage Structure Report recommended that the building at 234 Lakeshore Road East be designated for historical, architectural and contextual reasons.

In summation, the Town stated that it was presenting the Heritage Structure Report for the Board's consideration and decision.

Presentation by the Owner

The owner's evidence presented at the hearing consisted of a colour photograph of the building, which was added to Exhibit #4. The owner also gave a lengthy description of the repairs and changes that had been made to the building since he acquired it. He stated that he couldn't afford to maintain the detail when he covered much of the building with aluminum siding, which obscures some of the polychromatic brick.

The owner indicated that the store front of the building had been completely re-done, the original multicoloured corners and the original pilasters had been removed and windows changed. The original wooden shingles are gone and the chimneys altered. The owner pointed out that the back of the building also underwent transformations; the roof was covered with tar paper and the sides were covered with aluminum siding. The owner confirmed that two original dormers were still in place, but stated that the upper west-facing facade on which the remnant of the turn-of-the-century advertisement appears was damaged when a neon sign was recently removed from the facade.

The owner did not take a strong position in favour or against designation of the building, although he felt designation could make future repairs more complicated and expensive. Basically, he felt that the building was not a good example of the heritage of Oakville because it had been so extensively altered and therefore was not worthy of designation.

Other Presentations

None

Findings

Under questioning from the Board, the expert witness for the Town of Oakville agreed with the owner's contention that the building had been so extensively altered that it was not worthy of designation.

The structure at 234 Lakeshore Road East is an example of an older building which has been considerably altered to the detriment of its original character, although it maintains its basic form and plan and some of its early features. The Board notes that there are many instances in Ontario where such buildings have been successfully rehabilitated through the concerted efforts of an interested owner with the support of the municipality.

In this instance, a persuasive case was not made to the Board for designation of the property at 234 Lakeshore Road East. The Board is of the opinion that there is not sufficient historical, architectural or contextual interest to warrant designation of the property.

Recommendations

- (1) The Board recommends, based on the evidence heard and presented to it, that the property at 234 Lakeshore Road East not be designated under the Ontario Heritage Act.
- (2) The Board encourages the municipality, when considering designation of such a property in future, to discuss the benefits of rehabilitation and forms of assistance available with the owner, early in the process.

(Signed)		
Robert Bowes	Nathalie Boutet	
Chairman	Member	

List of Exhibits

Exhibit

- 1. Affidavit of Notice of Hearing.
- 2. Planning Service Department resolution dated January 18, 1993.
- 3. Staff Report, Town of Oakville, regarding the Heritage Designation of 234 Lakeshore Road East, dated January 7, 1993, also containing a Heritage Structure Report.
- 4. Four (4) colour photographs of the said property.